New York City’s Ethnic Media in the Digital Age

Matthew Matsaganis, Ph.D.
Associate Professor & Principal Investigator

December 2016
1. Ethnic media serve communities’ critical information needs, but can they continue to do so in the digital age?

2. Investigating what is referred to as the institutional dimension of the digital divide

3. To inform a discussion of how to support ethnic media efforts to become more competitive in the new media landscape

4. New York City is one of the largest (if not the largest) media markets and one of the most diverse cities in the U.S.
Phase 1: Survey of Ethnic Media Producers

- **103** in total
- A total of **86** media that completed the survey indicated that they produced a newsletter, newspaper, or magazine
- **14** media reported producing content for radio
- **19** for television
- Together all the ethnic media organizations that participated in the survey reported serving populations of people who were either born in or traced their ancestry to over **30 different countries**.
## Methodology

### Phase 2: Interviews with Ethnic Media Producers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Media Type</th>
<th>Availability Options</th>
<th>Number of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Print Media (Newspapers and Magazines)</strong></td>
<td>Hard Copy Format Only</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Available Online Only</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hard Copy Format and Online</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Radio</strong></td>
<td>Over the Air Only</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Available Online Only</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Over the Air and Online</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Television</strong></td>
<td>Over the Air or Cable Only</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Available Online Only</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Over the Air or Cable and Online</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Interviews: 20
**FINDINGS**

Presence on the Web, Social Media, and Apps

- **Web Presence**
  - Yes, the organization has a website now: 70%
  - No, the organization does not have a website now, but it did have in the past: 3%
  - No, the organization never had a website: 9%

- **Social Media Presence**
  - Yes, we do currently have an account on social media: 82%
  - No, we do not have an account on social media now, but we had one in the past: 11%
  - No, we never had a social media account: 5%

  I do not know/I cannot say: 2%

- **App Presence**
  - Yes, we do have an app now: 57%
  - No, we do not have an app now, but we had one in the past: 6%
  - No, we never had an app: 30%

  I don't know/I can't say: 7%
The Internet is helpful for...
**FINDINGS**

Additional motivations for being online

1- The Internet as Critical for Content Production and Distribution

2- A Presence Online is Necessary for Branding

3- The Internet Brings More Competition, But Also Opportunities for Growth

**Interviewer:** “Today is Wednesday, so today is your printing day. For the radio, how do you develop the programs? Do you have people that produce specific programs over the course of the week?”

**Producer:** “I have somebody in India. It’s South Asian Radio. She’s preparing the programs and links and then she puts them on the FTP, and then I have somebody in Karachi in Pakistan. He’s making his programming and puts it on the FTP.”

**Interviewer:** “Okay, I see. And with your magazine?”

**Producer:** “I have an office in India. I have an office in Pakistan and here is my office, too. So basically I control all that and we print here in New York. But I’ll just pay for making the pages in Pakistan.”

*Interview with producer of print media and radio programming for South Asian-origin audiences*
1 - The Internet as Critical for Content Production and Distribution

2 - A Presence Online is Necessary for Branding

“...And our business model was always focusing on the print. The reason why I have a website is because every publication has to be on the internet, and you have to be there, you have to be able to connect to people, you have to be able to tell people.”

Producer of a newspaper for Latino audiences

3 - The Internet Brings More Competition, But Also Opportunities for Growth
1-The Internet as Critical for Content Production and Distribution

2-A Presence Online is Necessary for Branding

3-The Internet Brings More Competition, But Also Opportunities for Growth

“We don’t only cover the business material. There is a possibility that we can grow more. That’s what we believe. And at the same time, we wanted to get more readers from Japan, too. Because the people from Japan, they’re also interested in New York. They wanted to come here and have a business, of course, for the trip, too… Like, they do overseas travel a lot. So we wanted to spread the story from New York to Japan.”

Producer of newspaper for Japanese-origin audiences
## Activities on the Web

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Posts text stories</td>
<td>71.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posts photos</td>
<td>68.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posts videos</td>
<td>44.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides audience members with information they can use to communicate with the organization (for example, an e-mail)</td>
<td>40.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allows audience members to post public comments about things the organization has posted on the website</td>
<td>38.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streams audio and/or video live for the audience</td>
<td>22.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Makes information available through RSS feeds</td>
<td>21.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publishes/Hosts the blogs of staff members of the organization (e.g., editors/journalists)</td>
<td>18.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allows audience members to communicate with members of the organization (journalists/producers) via online forms</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posts podcasts</td>
<td>12.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hosts conversations among website users and staff members in online discussion groups</td>
<td>8.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### FINDINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>30%</td>
<td>...said <em>75% or more</em> of the content that they produced was <em>original</em> and <em>produced by their staff members</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25%</td>
<td>...said between <em>50% and 75%</em> of their content was <em>original</em> and <em>produced by their staff</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30%</td>
<td>...said <em>over 25% but not more than 50%</em> of their content was <em>original</em> and <em>produced by their staff</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16%</td>
<td>...said <em>no more than 25%</em> was <em>original</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FINDINGS

Content Online & Offline

How much of the content you make available to your audience via your website can the audience ALSO find offline? (%)

NONE of the online content can also be found offline (All content is made exclusively for the Internet)

SOME of the online content can also be found offline.

MOST of the online content can also be found offline.

ALL of the online content can also be found offline.
When you access your organization's website from a smartphone, tablet, or some other mobile device, how user-friendly would you say that it is?

- Not user friendly at all: 9%
- Somewhat user friendly: 22%
- Very user friendly: 46%
- I can't say/I don't know: 23%

FINDINGS

Mobile-friendly?
How do you manage your website’s content? (%)

- We have full-time paid staff members that manage our organization's website: 24%
- We have part-time paid staff members that manage our organization's website: 24%
- We rely on paid contractors to update and maintain our organization's website: 6%
- We count on volunteers or interns to help us update and maintain our organization's website: 20%
- We do not have specific people that help us manage our organization’s website: 24%
- I do not know: 2%
“The online edition needs maintenance. If not daily, at least weekly. I knew a young married couple. They offered to maintain this for free just to help me out. I also made a financial deal with them in case their website and design generated publicity and income. Then, we would split it in half…. Not from the print. I send them the material I want to put online. I’m not putting everything that’s in the paper online. Basically, just editorials. The writers that write for me and the paper have to be online as well. Also, some news, but not the whole paper…. They do everything they want. I said, ‘Go ahead and do whatever you want.’ No, I don’t give orders. This is a free press. I said, ‘You guys do whatever you want online.’”

Producer of a publication for Romanian-origin audiences

Our original content must go on the web; that is obvious. And we have an arrangement with the news agency, IANS. They are actually maintaining our website, so they automatically upload news which will be of more interest to Indians living in America. There, they upload it on the website, our website. And our own original stories, which we – most – all our original stories, we also send to them, and they upload on the website.”

Producer of newspaper for South Asian-origin audience
“Because we have a very small staff, everyone is responsible for putting their own stories online. I type my story, the paper goes to the printing shop and then it’s my decision whether to put this story up immediately or wait a couple of hours…. Yes. It’s a mutual decision. It’s a small [news]room, so we talk about which stories should be put up first and then the sequence of all the stories…”

Producer of newspaper for Polish-origin audiences

“I just tried to look at how successful publications do [it] and mirrored that. The New York Times, New York Magazine; those are the two major ones.”

Producer of newspaper for Haitian-origin audiences
Strategies for developing an audience base

1- Selectively Publishing Online Content Available Offline

2- Posting “Teasers” for Stories Published Off the Web

3- Organizing Contests to Drive Audience to the Website

4- Multimedia Storytelling

“When people go online to read the news, they just read the news; they don’t pay attention to the advertisements. We survive on advertisements. My boss sees the circulation dropping. So, we slow down. This whole section is full [of ads], but only part of them [are also] on the web. If you really want to know what is going on you still need to buy the paper. Just part of the news [is] on the web.”

Producer of a newspaper for Chinese-origin audiences
FINDINGS

Strategies for developing an audience base

1-Selectively Publishing Online Content Available Offline

2-Posting “Teasers” for Stories Published Off the Web

3-Organizing Contests to Drive Audience to the Website

4-Multimedia Storytelling

“Sometimes we blog stories for our subscribers. For four or five hours, people can only see the headline and then they have to wait for the service, but we don’t do it on a regular basis. We are trying to do it for very big stories…. It’s a small organization, so we are improvising.”

Producer of newspaper for Polish-origin audiences
FINDINGS

Strategies for developing an audience base

1- Selectively Publishing Online Content Available Offline

2- Posting “Teasers” for Stories Published Off the Web

3- Organizing Contests to Drive Audience to the Website

4- Multimedia Storytelling

“We’ll also do contests and things like that we promote on the newspaper, and they make people go to the website in order to fill out a form, or just something in order to win for something…. And usually, when we do contests and things like that, these people have to fill out a form, and one of the questions that we ask them is that ‘What kind of a content they would like to see on the website, on the paper?’ And we try to pay attention to that.”

Producer of a newspaper for Latino audiences
FINDINGS

Strategies for developing an audience base

1-Selectively Publishing Online Content Available Offline

2-Posting “Teasers” for Stories Published Off the Web

3-Organizing Contests to Drive Audience to the Website

4-Multimedia Storytelling

“Let's take the first – you create quantities of content. Let's say we each videotape this interview. It's part video and it's part audio. The guys in Africa and Tanzania where there's no or limited broadband – or even in rural America – they may not be able to access video. But some can access video and access it at different bit rates. So the idea would be to create work where some people can access it as a video file and others can access it as a low resolution audio file and others can access it as a high resolution audio…. And there's also a transcript…. So there are multiple access points to one content.”

Producer of radio programming for audiences of African origin
“I think an app would be a good way for us to get some revenue in the future because I do believe that there is money to be made online. We just have to be strategic about how we go about it. And I think that people would pay for content if it’s presented in an easy, accessible and pretty [way]. I think people would pay for an app if they just download it one time. Or even pay $0.99 a month or something, if the information’s coming directly to them conveniently.”

Producer of newspaper for Haitian-origin audiences

“Developing a news app is about] embellishments, merely to fool the advertisers into believing they are a professional company.”

Producer of newspaper for South Asian-origin audiences
FINDINGS
Constraining/Enabling factors of Internet use

1-Online Ventures Considered Not Profitable

2-Limited Knowledge of the Internet among Producers & Advertisers

3-Perceptions about Audience’s Online Engagement

4-Lack of Interest by Owners/Management

5-The Role of Competition across Borders Fueled by Technological Innovation

6-Instrumental Support from Younger Family Members as an Enabling Factor

“I told you that the other newspaper tried to establish the digital and the subscription is dropping. So we slowed down ourselves because my boss is scared to lose the same thing. So, we also believe that sooner or later, maybe [in] 10 or 20 years, the newspaper is going to disappear. We know that. Now, we are just still doing both [online and offline], because we still earn a lot of money [from our offline edition].

Producer of newspaper for Chinese-origin audiences
FINDINGS

Constraining/Enabling factors of Internet use

1. Online Ventures Considered Not Profitable

2. Limited Knowledge of the Internet among Producers & Advertisers

3. Perceptions about Audience’s Online Engagement

4. Lack of Interest by Owners/Management

5. The Role of Competition across Borders Fueled by Technological Innovation

6. Instrumental Support from Younger Family Members as an Enabling Factor

“The Internet is very important, and I guess everybody – all the kids have to grow in technology, on the Internet, but in many ways, people don’t know what to do on the Internet, or how the Internet functions, and they’re investing a lot of money, but they don’t know what to do. What I do is I sell advertising for the print – the newspaper, right? And I also sell – that’s probably 90 per cent of my income. And then, the other 10 per cent or so is coming from the Internet, but a lot of people don’t want to invest in the Internet; they don’t even understand the concept.”

Producer of a newspaper for Latino audiences
FINDINGS

Constraining/Enabling factors of Internet use

1-Online Ventures Considered Not Profitable

2-Limited Knowledge of the Internet among Producers & Advertisers

3-Perceptions about Audience’s Online Engagement

4-Lack of Interest by Owners/Management

5-The Role of Competition across Borders Fueled by Technological Innovation

6-Instrumental Support from Younger Family Members as an Enabling Factor

“And to tell you the truth, the Latino community doesn’t look for that new technology, yet. And that probably applies to the Anglo community, too …. And that’s also the same for a daily newspaper like El Diario, or La Prensa. They also said that 90 per cent of their income comes from print, and they were really heavily invested in the new technology on the Internet, but they shared a few months ago that they are going back to the paper. Of course, the business model is not there to make money on the Internet.”

Producer of a newspaper for Latino audiences
FINDINGS

Constraining/Enabling factors of Internet use

1-Online Ventures Considered Not Profitable
2-Limited Knowledge of the Internet among Producers & Advertisers
3-Perceptions about Audience’s Online Engagement
4-Lack of Interest by Owners/Management
5-The Role of Competition across Borders Fueled by Technological Innovation
6-Instrumental Support from Younger Family Members as an Enabling Factor

“There is no effort made to adapt.... You have to also remember one more thing: [in] most of these ethnic media communities, the owners have other professions. So where they make their money and their wealth, is in a different site. This [media production] is a hobby. When such is the case, there is no need for it to change, to make it better, or find new ways of doing business, or expanding it, or growing it.”

Producer of newspaper for Indian-origin audiences
CONSTRaining/Enabling factors of Internet use

1- Online Ventures Considered Not Profitable

2- Limited Knowledge of the Internet among Producers & Advertisers

3- Perceptions about Audience’s Online Engagement

4- Lack of Interest by Owners/Management

5- The Role of Competition across Borders Fueled by Technological Innovation

6- Instrumental Support from Younger Family Members as an Enabling Factor

“We have some channel [that] came from the motherland and we could not compete with the nicer broadcasting. They were trying to get every business they could have. So we quit the radio, we quit the television. So I went to the newspaper again because it was print media. Yeah, the competition was strong in the television industry…. This is also from the channels produced in Pakistan and no channels are produced here.”

Producer of radio programming and a newspaper for Pakistani-origin audiences
FINDINGS

Constraining/Enabling factors of Internet use

1. Online Ventures Considered Not Profitable
2. Limited Knowledge of the Internet among Producers & Advertisers
3. Perceptions about Audience’s Online Engagement
4. Lack of Interest by Owners/Management
5. The Role of Competition across Borders Fueled by Technological Innovation
6. Instrumental Support from Younger Family Members as an Enabling Factor

“Then my son, he's helping me. He makes some programming, he put in FTP from here and then I'll do three then make some nice song where in Karachi and they put it on FTP, radio...”

Producer of newspaper for South Asian-origin audiences
Ethnic media & social media

FINDINGS

- Yes, we do currently have an account on social media: 82%
- No, we do not have an account on social media now, but we had one in the past: 11%
- No, we never had a social media account: 2%
- I do not know/I cannot say: 5%

“The economic downturn may not have hit us that hard. What is hitting us is social media. Like social media, like right now Facebook is so strong that even the likes of the New York Times, and Washington Post, they all are trying to find a home within Facebook or Twitter, or YouTube. You cannot survive without that.”

Producer of newspaper for South Asian-origin audiences
### FINDINGS

Social media are helpful for...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Not Very Important</th>
<th>Somewhat Important</th>
<th>Quite Important</th>
<th>Very Important</th>
<th>Don't Know/Not Applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring what people are saying about your organization</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>9.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning about your audience</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>34.8</td>
<td>44.6</td>
<td>43.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting feedback from the audience on stories you have published</td>
<td>35.3</td>
<td>36.4</td>
<td>37.9</td>
<td>36.9</td>
<td>27.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting suggestions for new stories</td>
<td>23.5</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>18.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interacting with your audience</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attracting potential advertisers</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>12.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building up your brand</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>36.9</td>
<td>36.4</td>
<td>27.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competing more effectively against other ethnic media who serve the same audiences that you do</td>
<td>20.6</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>7.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competing against mainstream media more effectively</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>36.9</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>7.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interacting with other media</td>
<td>46.2</td>
<td>43.1</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>9.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Monitoring what people are saying about your organization
- Learning about your audience
- Getting feedback from the audience on stories you have published
- Getting suggestions for new stories
- Interacting with your audience
- Attracting potential advertisers
- Building up your brand
- Competing more effectively against other ethnic media who serve the same audiences that you do
- Competing against mainstream media more effectively
- Interacting with other media

- Not Very Important
- Somewhat Important
- Quite Important
- Very Important
- Don't Know/Not Applicable
FINDINGS
Additional motivations for using social media

1- Staying on Top of the News and Finding Leads for Stories
2- Employing Social Media to Cover Major News Events
3- Coordinating Work Teams within the Country and Across Borders
4- Promoting Content, but also Building the Organization’s Brand
5- Using Multiple Social Media and Apps to Promote the Organization
6- Engaging with the Audience and the Ethnic Community Served
7- Growing the Organization’s Audience Base
8- Developing New Revenue Streams

“Nowadays, social media are playing a very positive role in the media also. If you go on the social media, you get a lot of leads. I mean every time you visit some site, social media site, you get some lead for example. If something [is] happening somewhere, people put it on Facebook so you get the lead.”

Producer of newspaper for South Asian-origin audiences
FINDINGS
Additional motivations for using social media

1- Staying on Top of the News and Finding Leads for Stories
2- Employing Social Media to Cover Major News Events
3- Coordinating Work Teams within the Country and Across Borders
4- Promoting Content, but also Building the Organization’s Brand
5- Using Multiple Social Media and Apps to Promote the Organization
6- Engaging with the Audience and the Ethnic Community Served
7- Growing the Organization’s Audience Base
8- Developing New Revenue Streams

“Mostly, we use a Skype. In the last election, we covered the whole election with Skype, from Dhaka, Bangladesh. They called us on Skype, and we shot all the voting process over here, the people “spinning” the election and then giving their opinion. Skype is very helpful. Every day, we [use] Skype for reporting.”

Producer of newspaper for South Asian-origin audiences
FINDINGS

Additional motivations for using social media

1-Staying on Top of the News and Finding Leads for Stories

2-Employing Social Media to Cover Major News Events

3-Coordinating Work Teams within the Country and Across Borders

4-Promoting Content, but also Building the Organization’s Brand

5-Using Multiple Social Media and Apps to Promote the Organization

6-Engaging with the Audience and the Ethnic Community Served

7-Growing the Organization’s Audience Base

8-Developing New Revenue Streams

“Mainly we use email, and it seems to work pretty well, and when I need to call [contributing editors], they’re always available. We also use Facebook to discuss things that we want to do, or information that we want to provide to one another.”

Producer of a newspaper for Latino audiences
FINDINGS

Additional motivations for using social media

1- Staying on Top of the News and Finding Leads for Stories

2- Employing Social Media to Cover Major News Events

3- Coordinating Work Teams within the Country and Across Borders

4- Promoting Content, but also Building the Organization’s Brand

5- Using Multiple Social Media and Apps to Promote the Organization

6- Engaging with the Audience and the Ethnic Community Served

7- Growing the Organization’s Audience Base

8- Developing New Revenue Streams

“I principally use Facebook…. What I posted got shared by a small number of people then it grew. And then I sort of neglected Twitter. I just went back to it recently. This is important. I got republished by Philippine papers [in the Philippines]. And also by certain sites here… That really helped a lot. So in my advertising packet, I say that when you are featured in [magazine’s name], there is a chance that you might get picked up by this or that publication.”

Producer of an online-only magazine for Filipino-origin audiences
FINDINGS
Additional motivations for using social media

1- Staying on Top of the News and Finding Leads for Stories
2- Employing Social Media to Cover Major News Events
3- Coordinating Work Teams within the Country and Across Borders
4- Promoting Content, but also Building the Organization’s Brand
5- Using Multiple Social Media and Apps to Promote the Organization
6- Engaging with the Audience and the Ethnic Community Served
7- Growing the Organization’s Audience Base
8- Developing New Revenue Streams

“I started putting my shows on the Sound Cloud. And, Sound Cloud is very easy for me to stream the shows. I don’t have to pay for the hosting. Then, anybody who has the Sound Cloud app on their phone can listen to our shows easily. Then, from Sound Cloud, it’s already connected with many other social media – Facebook, Twitter. So, when I post on Sound Cloud, it automatically goes to the Sound Cloud community; it goes to Facebook; Twitter, and all of those.”

Producer of radio programming for Nepali-origin audiences
**FINDINGS**

**Additional motivations for using social media**

1. Staying on Top of the News and Finding Leads for Stories
2. Employing Social Media to Cover Major News Events
3. Coordinating Work Teams within the Country and Across Borders
4. Promoting Content, but also Building the Organization’s Brand
5. Using Multiple Social Media and Apps to Promote the Organization
6. Engaging with the Audience and the Ethnic Community Served
7. Growing the Organization’s Audience Base
8. Developing New Revenue Streams

“Well, for me, as an active user of social media, I think for any organization, especially for an industry, it’s very important for them to do two-way communication. Because really when they do the broadcasting, it’s one-way communication. So, the audience receives information that the radio station suddenly has feedback from the audience. And I think social media is a good platform for the company to talk with their audience.”

*Producer of radio programming for Chinese-origin audiences*
FINDINGS

Additional motivations for using social media

1. Staying on Top of the News and Finding Leads for Stories
2. Employing Social Media to Cover Major News Events
3. Coordinating Work Teams within the Country and Across Borders
4. Promoting Content, but also Building the Organization’s Brand
5. Using Multiple Social Media and Apps to Promote the Organization
6. Engaging with the Audience and the Ethnic Community Served
7. Growing the Organization’s Audience Base
8. Developing New Revenue Streams

“Singers come from Japan to have their big live sing here. And then that’s when we interview them. Then of course we do post information on Twitter and Facebook. But then their fans try to follow them, and then they happen to reach us. Now we have one more reason for them to see our paper at same time.”

Producer of newspaper for Japanese-origin audiences
FINDINGS

Additional motivations for using social media

1. Staying on Top of the News and Finding Leads for Stories
2. Employing Social Media to Cover Major News Events
3. Coordinating Work Teams within the Country and Across Borders
4. Promoting Content, but also Building the Organization’s Brand
5. Using Multiple Social Media and Apps to Promote the Organization
6. Engaging with the Audience and the Ethnic Community Served
7. Growing the Organization’s Audience Base
8. Developing New Revenue Streams

“Also we use [Facebook] for promotional purposes. So that’s one of our [most valuable] resources. So let’s say you’re having an event. You have packages where we’ll have a featured post for the week and that would be $30.00. Or we’ll do social media promotion for you for a month and that will be $50.00.”

Producer of newspaper for Haitian-origin audiences
FINDINGS

Most used social media

% of Ethnic Media Organizations on Social Media

FACEBOOK 68.9
TWITTER 51.5
YOUTUBE 34.0
GOOGLE+ 23.3
LINKEDIN 21.4
INSTAGRAM 9.7
FLICKR 6.8
TUMBLR 4.9
VIDEOS 3.9
PINTEREST 2.9
ITUNES 2.9
WECHAT 1.9
WEIBO 1.0
MYSPACE 1.0

On average, the ethnic media organizations that participated in the survey reported having accounts on **three (3)** different social media.
“Last year or this year, WeChat dominated. Every function has been covered, like [for example, the functions of] Twitter and you can buy stuff using WeChat. You can pay somebody for stuff with WeChat.... In one app. So, a lot of people are using WeChat, and I'm thinking WeChat is the trend for social media use, and we have to do that. I'm planning to open WeChat for my show, so people who can't listen to the radio or use the computer can listen to my show through their phone. Because right now the phones are more popular because people can use them anywhere.”

Producer of newspaper for Chinese-origin audiences
“Facebook, yes people do ‘like’ a lot of our posts. People do share a lot of our posts. Then we try to go through it. We try to analyze the data like, what is the age percentile? And so far predominantly it has been a mature audience. An audience which I would say is 25 or 30 years plus up to 70. They seem to be the ones who are liking it, reading it. And that, actually confirms the research that there are more baby boomers, or the older generation, beyond plus 30 or 40 who are joining Facebook more. And the younger generation is leaving it. We are trying to compensate that with Instagram and WhatsApp.”

Producer of newspaper for South Asian-origin audiences
“Because the person who did my website suggested let’s go on Pinterest because we have a lot of stories on fashion and food, and those are huge on Pinterest. I said, ‘Okay.’ He made a decision for me .... The paper was covering New York Fashion Week. He’s like, ‘You have a lot of pictures on fashion. I think this is best on Pinterest.’”

Producer of an online-only magazine for Filipino-origin audiences
“Twitter seems to have more impact when it comes to media than Facebook. I think it’s probably because Facebook is constantly changing their algorithms. They’re constantly manipulating it in such a way to benefit them. It appears to me that Twitter is mostly trying to reach as many people as possible. It appears that they’re not blocking that. Facebook appears to be manipulating that more so they can make money for their reasons.”

Producer of radio programming for audiences of African origin
**FINDINGS**

**Managing Social Media**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Several times a day</td>
<td>32.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>About once a day</td>
<td>23.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Several times a week</td>
<td>23.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>About once a week</td>
<td>6.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Several times a month</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>About once a month</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than once a month</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How often does someone from your organization post something on social media sites using your organization’s account or profile? (％)
FINDINGS

Managing Social Media

How often does someone from your organization post something on social media sites using your organization’s account or profile? (%)

- Several times a day: 32.8%
- About once a day: 23.0%
- Several times a week: 6.6%
- About once a week: 4.9%
- Several times a month: 4.9%
- About once a month: 4.9%
- Less than once a month: 4.9%

How do you manage your organization’s social media accounts or profiles? (%)

- We have full-time paid staff members that manage our organization’s social media accounts: 24%
- We have part-time paid staff members that manage our organization’s social media accounts: 6%
- We rely on paid contractors to update and maintain our organization’s social media accounts: 24%
- We count on volunteers or interns to help us update and maintain our organization’s social media accounts: 20%
- We count on volunteers or interns to help us update and maintain our organization’s social media accounts: 2%
Managing Social Media

How often does someone from your organization post something on social media sites using your organization’s account or profile? (%)

- Several times a day: 32.8%
- About once a day: 24%
- Several times a week: 2%
- About once a week: 20%
- Several times a month: 24%
- About once a month: 6%
- Less than once a month: 2%

How do you manage your organization’s social media accounts or profiles? (%)

- We have full-time paid staff members that manage our organization’s social media accounts: 23%
- We have part-time paid staff members that manage our organization’s social media accounts: 33%
- We rely on paid contractors to update and maintain our organization’s social media accounts: 29%
- We count on volunteers or interns to help us update and maintain our organization’s social media accounts: 7%

To how many of the comments people post on social media about your organization or about stories you have produced do you reply? (%)

- We reply to all of them: 8%
- We reply to most of them: 23%
- We reply to some of them: 33%
- We do not reply to any of them: 29%
- I do not know/I am not sure: 7%
Managing Social Media

“I used to be in charge of the social media, Facebook. We share the account, so not only I have the right to do it.”

Producer of radio programming for Chinese-origin audiences

“Well, we have a Facebook page. I think that three or four people have access to that, including me. So, if I see it appropriate, I can reply [to people’s comments]. It doesn’t matter. Any of us can do it.”

Producer of newspaper for Latino audience

“Three, four people do [manage the account]. It’s a small company, so we always talk. So when we share something, like you say, ‘Okay, why don’t we do this and this?’ And then we just do it.”

Producer of newspaper for Japanese-origin audiences
FINDINGS

Factors constraining & enabling social media use

1- Limited Time
2- Lack of Human Resources
3- Lack Financial Resources (Limited Advertising Base)
4- Knowledge and Experience
5- Perceptions about the Ethnic Community’s Experience with Social Media
6- Importance of Ethnic Media for Certain Types of Information Being Challenged by the Internet

“There are thousands of people reading and making comments. I don’t have to get into it because there is no physical time to do it. Sometimes on my Facebook account I make comments. Say I write three or four columns with a question. I wait for answers. Then, I read them. There is no physical time to go through them.”

Producer of newspaper for Romanian-origin audiences
FINDINGS
Factors **constraining** & **enabling** social media use

1- Limited Time

2- Lack of Human Resources

3- Lack Financial Resources (Limited Advertising Base)

4- Knowledge and Experience

5- Perceptions about the Ethnic Community’s Experience with Social Media

6- Importance of Ethnic Media for Certain Types of Information Being Challenged by the Internet

“So, I’m more active in social media. Earlier, I introduced a lot of social media knowledge to my boss who’s in charge of the radio station. So, now she’s more familiar with Facebook usage. She can post more on her own,... If our organization had a WeChat account itself, and of course, [if] we had people to maintain it. I think that’s a challenge because we don’t have enough staff. We don’t have enough people, especially technology specialists to work on this.”

Producer of radio programming for Chinese-origin audiences
FINDINGS

Factors **constraining** & **enabling** social media use

1- Limited Time
2- Lack of Human Resources
3- Lack Financial Resources (Limited Advertising Base)
4- Knowledge and Experience
5- Perceptions about the Ethnic Community’s Experience with Social Media
6- Importance of Ethnic Media for Certain Types of Information Being Challenged by the Internet

“I’m the only one who runs the paper, okay? So my worry is that even if I wanted to upgrade maybe my website – I have all these bells and whistles. I have a lot of features. One, I may not have the resources to finance it and two, if something goes wrong I wouldn’t know where to go. So not unless I hire a webmaster or something, which I cannot afford.”

“But there are other Filipino mom and pop stores like restaurants, they wanted a print presence because they want something they can post on their wall.”

*Producer of an online-only magazine for Filipino-origin audiences*
FINDINGS

Factors constraining & enabling social media use

1. Limited Time
2. Lack of Human Resources
3. Lack Financial Resources (Limited Advertising Base)
4. Knowledge and Experience
5. Perceptions about the Ethnic Community’s Experience with Social Media
6. Importance of Ethnic Media for Certain Types of Information Being Challenged by the Internet

“[T]o be honest with you, although Twitter has been around for a long time, now, we’re still trying to get to use it. I know that we have many conversations about this with our team about Twitter, and a need to use it more. But I guess that many of us are not very familiar with it…. I know that we were discussing, for example, using Twitter to live tweet events where we are covering or something. But sometimes it seems like a challenge to us because we have to pay attention, and we have to [take] notes, and we have to do videos and now we have to do Twitter.

Producer of a newspaper for Latino audiences
FINDINGS
Factors constraining & enabling social media use

1. Limited Time
2. Lack of Human Resources
3. Lack Financial Resources (Limited Advertising Base)
4. Knowledge and Experience
5. Perceptions about the Ethnic Community’s Experience with Social Media
6. Importance of Ethnic Media for Certain Types of Information Being Challenged by the Internet

“Now, for Latinos to make comments, after they read a story, it’s still very, very difficult to get comments from the Latino community. Let’s say when you write something about a politician, you get some comments. Or if you write something about entertainment, or sports. But it’s still too difficult to get Latinos to write about civic engagement, or civic participation, or community events; it’s very, very difficult …. Because maybe they have not connected to the system very well yet because, maybe they don’t like to comment on strong issues because they don’t feel like they have the right information; a lot of issues, right?”

Producer of a newspaper for Latino audiences
FINDINGS
Factors constraining & enabling social media use

1- Limited Time
2- Lack of Human Resources
3- Lack Financial Resources (Limited Advertising Base)
4- Knowledge and Experience
5- Perceptions about the Ethnic Community’s Experience with Social Media
6- Importance of Ethnic Media for Certain Types of Information Being Challenged by the Internet

“These days, my listeners are coming down because of all those technologies.... The listeners get their messages on Facebook and Twitter. They don't really wait for my shows to happen. Last week I talked about TPS – Temporary Protective Status for Nepali immigrants. Because of the earthquake, some people cannot go back to their country. So, I invited our immigration lawyers to talk about it. So, now there are a lot of other online portals that are doing that. So, they don't wait for my interview to listen. I used to be the only [source]. And they waited for my shows to listen. Now, we have a lot of lawyers, and they have a lot of new portals.”

Producer of radio programming for Nepali-origin audiences
Predicting Social Media Adoption & Use

What Determines Ethnic Media Producers’ Intentions to Adopt and Use Social Media?

- Performance Expectancy
- Effort Expectancy
- Perceived Competition against Mainstream Media
- Communication about Technology (in the Organization)

Intention to Use Social Media

Actual Use of Social Media
FINDINGS

Ahead of the Curve or Behind?

- How does your organization compare to mainstream media in terms of how much they use new communication and information technologies, like the Internet and social media?

- How does your organization compare to other ethnic media that serve the same audiences or communities that you do in terms of how much they use new communication and information technologies, like the Internet and social media?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Ahead of the Curve (%)</th>
<th>About Average (%)</th>
<th>Behind the Curve (%)</th>
<th>I Do Not Know (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AHEAD OF THE CURVE (%)</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>57.6</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABOUT AVERAGE (%)</td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>44.0</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEHIND THE CURVE (%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I DO NOT KNOW (%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
48% of the ethnic media organizations with a website that participated in the survey indicated that they had no more than 20,000 unique visitors on their site every month.

16% indicated that they did not know how many visitors they had per month.

44% said they had no more than 20,000 page views per month and 1 in 5 producers said they did not know how many page views they received.
### Online Metrics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metric</th>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of Facebook &quot;likes&quot;</td>
<td>We do not pay any attention to this</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of stories that we publish online that get shared by people on Facebook</td>
<td>We do not pay any attention to this</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Twitter followers</td>
<td>We do not pay any attention to this</td>
<td>13.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of stories that get re-tweeted by audience members</td>
<td>We do not pay any attention to this</td>
<td>15.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback we get via e-mail</td>
<td>We do not pay any attention to this</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of comments we get in response to our organization’s Facebook posts</td>
<td>We do not pay any attention to this</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of comments we get on stories we post on our website</td>
<td>We do not pay any attention to this</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of people who have downloaded our applications (or apps) to their smartphone, tablet, or laptop</td>
<td>We do not pay any attention to this</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The number of people who open the e-mails we send them</td>
<td>We do not pay any attention to this</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend:
- "Do not pay any attention to this"
- "Pay some attention to this"
- "Pay a lot of attention to this"
- "I don’t know/I am not sure"
- "This does not apply to our organization"
Some **conclusions**

- Despite limited financial and human resources, the majority of New York City’s ethnic media that participated in the study indicate that they are adapting to the changing media landscape.

- **Opportunities** include: (1) expanding audience base, (2) making advantage of media production expertise outside of the U.S.

- **Challenges** include: (1) competition from mainstream media based in country (countries) of origin, (2) lack of business model online, (3) “cannibalization”, (4) ownership’s priorities/goals, (5) perceptions about audience’s digital connectedness and literacy.
1. **Do Invest resources to develop digital platforms**
   
   (If and when you can)
   
   (this also means continuing to educate yourself on current technological innovations and tools that you can use on the job)
Some recommendations

2. Focus on developing locally relevant content

Connective [❌] ?

Orientation [✓]

Affective [✓]

3. Identify new audiences
4. **Make technology a topic of ongoing conversation in the organization and set goals (identify what “success” looks like for your organization)**
Some recommendations

5. Collaborate to learn (Develop “leaning communities”)

6. Pool resources

![Survey Results]

Our competitors have been trying hard to lower their prices
Our competitors have been trying hard to promote new content
Our competitors have been trying hard to increase their market share in the area where our audience is based
Our competitors are working hard to adopt technology to engage audiences
Our competitors are investing in technology to help them produce new content

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>I Don't Know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>30.1</td>
<td>22.3</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>30.1</td>
<td>28.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>10.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>29.1</td>
<td>25.2</td>
<td>25.2</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Some recommendations

7. Support (and even conduct) audience research

Source of figures:
http://www.pewinternet.org/2016/07/14/digital-divides-2016/
8. Help change your advertisers’ perceptions that online advertising is not worth it OR that it does not work (show them that it does)
Special thanks to...

Jehangir Khattak
Karen Pennar

Garry Pierre-Pierre

Kizzy Cox
Bianca Flowers

Xin Zhou
Chendan (Cici) Cui-Laughton
Zhong Zheng

This report was supported through a grant made to the University at Albany, State University of New York by the Center for Community and Ethnic Media
Do you have questions or want to talk about implications of this research and how to help ethnic media take full of advantage of the Internet?

Matthew Matsaganis, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
Department of Communication
University at Albany
State University of New York (SUNY)
E-mail: mmatsaganis@albany.edu
Tel. +1 (518) 442-4860 (Office)